

Text Planner and Self-Assessment of Recount Writing Ability among Junior High School Students

Siti Mafulah^{1*}
Wiwik Sribudiati¹
Sanwal Haider²

¹English Education Program, Faculty of Language and Literature, Universitas
PGRI Kanjuruhan Malang, Malang, INDONESIA

²English Linguistics, Faculty of Humanity and Social Science, University of Sialkot,
Sialkot, PAKISTAN

Abstract

This study aims to explore whether the use of text planner combined with self-assessment affects students' recount text writing ability at junior high school students. The research employed a pre-experimental method using a one-group pretest- posttest design. The participants were 32 students from class VIII-H of SMP Negeri 1 Turen. The results showed a significant improvement in the students' recount writing performance from pretest to posttest. The average score increased from 67.27 to 80.08, indicating that the intervention of using a text planner combined with self-assessment has a positive impact. The Paired Samples T-test further confirmed the statistical significance of this improvement, with a p-value of 0.000, which is less than the standard significance level of 0.05. These findings suggest that the use of a text planner to guide the organization of recount texts, combined with self-assessment to enable students to critically evaluate their own writing, can be an effective approach to improve junior high school students' recount writing ability. The study provides valuable insights for educators seeking to implement evidence-based strategies to support students' development in this genre of writing. In addition, due to the limitation of this study, it is recommended for future researchers to conduct research on the different text type and the implementation in the different level of students so that the use of text planner combined with self-assessment can be generalized as an effective way to teach English Writing Skill.

Keywords: Text planner, students' self-assessment, writing, recount text

^{1*}Corresponding author, email: siti_mafulah@unikama.ac.id

Citation in APA style: Mafulah, Siti. (2024). Text Planner and Self-Assessment of Recount Writing Ability among Junior High School Students. *JOSAR, Vol. 9 Number 2*, 203-211.

Received:
August, 1st 2024

Revised:
August, 28th 2024

Published:
October, 8th 2024

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.35457/josar.v8i1.3938>

INTRODUCTION

Writing is considered as a fundamental skill that students must develop to succeed academically and communicate effectively. It is also considered as the most important ability to grasp foreign language especially for EFL learners (Richard and Renandya as cited in Situmorang, et al., 2023). Writing still becomes the necessary language skill that the students must master if they feel like they are successful in learning the language. Writing has significant support for other skills because if the students are good at writing, they can read and speak the text more effectively (Wahab and Astri, 2022) and it is more challenging (Sohli & Eginli, 2020). Therefore, many students feel it is difficult to write since it should embed what they feel and should deliver the message to the reader as well. Besides, in writing, students have to think, to express, and to organize what they think in a good paragraph so that the reader understands easily (Nunan, 2003). Writing is not an easy thing, especially in developing ideas. Most of us would agree that many students experience difficulties in writing. The difficulties faced are not only in developing the idea, but also in translating the idea into readable text (Lestari, 2023). Students must be able to deliver their thoughts and opinions, to make relationships among subjects to have good grammar and spelling, to use right mechanisms and vocabulary, and to show feelings and emotions (Weigle, 2002). In addition, Purba and Hutauruk (2022) stated that in writing, there are several aspects that should be considered by the writer such as structure of the content, aim of the content, how reader grasp the content, vocabulary, and also mechanics such as punctuation and spelling.

For junior high school students, one important genre of writing that they are expected to master is the recount text, which involves narrating a series of events in a logical and coherent manner. For many junior high school students, recount text presents a notable challenge, as they often encounter difficulties in comprehending the complexities of this specific type of writing. Research indicates that many junior high school students struggle with recount writing, often exhibiting weaknesses in areas such as organization, clarity, and attention to detail (Wijayatiningsih & Kurniawan, 2018). Similarly, Februansyah, Nugraha, and Fajriah (2020) revealed that students still find difficulties in organizing the structure and delivering ideas of recount text. These difficulties can stem from a lack of understanding of the genre's conventions, inadequate planning and drafting strategies, and insufficient metacognitive awareness of their own writing processes. This underscores the need for effective interventions that can address these challenges and empower students to become more confident and competent recount writers.

To address these issues, researchers have explored the potential of using text planners and self-assessment rubric to support students' recount writing development. According to Harris and Graham (1996) a text planner is a graphic organizer that helps students systematically plan the key elements of a passage such as the orientation, sequence of events and re-orientation before writing. Text planner guides students through the writing process, have been shown to enhance writing organization, coherence, and overall quality. A text planner can help students organize their ideas, while self-assessment can enable them to critically evaluate their own writing and make necessary revisions (Yoshida, 2018).

Regarding self-assessment, it has several benefits for student learning: Self-assessment helps students improve their exam performance, understand their work and

improve the quality of their assignments. It promotes more responsible and reflective learners compared to peer or teacher assessment. Self-assessment also provides students with power over their learning, enabling them to take responsibility for their learning and improve themselves as learners (Adiguna et al., 2023). Furthermore, self-assessment plays an important part in the development of students' learning. It leads students to a greater awareness and understanding of him/herself as a learner (Liu & Brantmeier, 2019; Mak & Wong, 2018). Boumediene and Fatiha (2021) explained that there is consideration to reach the learning outcome, they are knowing what the goal is and knowing what the need is, furthermore, they stated that students achieve their learning goal only if they know their goal and can see what they need to do to reach it. Besides, it offers students chance to do self-assessment, and make students actively learn for their goal. It also raises their responsibility for their own learning. Through self-assessment, students improve their writing skills by measuring their expected performance and determining their weaknesses and strengths in writing (Oscarson, 2009; Erman, 2022). In other words, self-assessment helps students do self-reflection (Aubrey et al., 2020; Wang, 2019).

There are some researchers focusing on the use of self-assessment. Study by Zhang and Zhang (2022) on the effects of using self-assessment on students' foreign language writing were able to demonstrate that the intervention group, where self-assessment was implemented, significantly improved overall writing performance and evaluation accuracy. Amelia, Ambarini, and Lestari (2023) also investigated the effectiveness of self-assessment through recount texts on improving writing skill. The findings proved that the implementation of self-assessment in class can be said to be quite effective as the result showed significant differences before and after the method is applied. Another research by Tampubolon, Sipayung, and Sagala (2023) also indicated that the use of self-assessment had a very good effect on students' writing ability. The results of the study showed that it was effective for students to use self-assessment strategies to retellings on written form, as a result, students in the experimental group scored higher in the post-test than students in the pre-test.

Though there are researchers focusing on the use of text planner like graphic organizer and self-assessment, there is still limited research on the combined effects of these two strategies, particularly in the context of junior high school recount writing. This study has the main aim to explore whether the use of text planner combined with self-assessment affects students improve their ability in writing recount text.

METHODS

A Quantitative approach, with pre-experimental method using the "One Group Pretest-Posttest Design" was applied in this research. There was one class as the participant, and it was given pretest and posttest to see the result of the treatment of implementing a text planner combined with self-assessment to improve the students' ability in writing recount text. Because the study is a single group and provides an intervention during the experiment so that there is no control group. The research design of One Group Pretest-Posttest Design can be seen in Table 1.

Table 1. The research group desain

Pre-test	Treatment	Pos-test
O ₁	x	O ₂

Note:

- O1: Pretest, the value of students' initial learning outcomes
- X : Treatment, the use of text planner combined with self-assessment
- O2: Posttest, to measure the effectiveness and value of student learning outcomes.

This research was carried out at SMP Negeri 1 Turen. It involves 32 students from class VIII-H as participants. The participants were selected using purposive sampling. The instruments used are pretest and posttest of writing recount text.

To ensure consistency and accuracy in collecting data, the study follows a specific procedure. It involves three main steps: pretest, intervention, and posttest. At the first step, the participants are given the pretest, this test was given to assess their writing skill before the intervention. The pre-test was about the recount text. Students were asked to write recount text with some prompt. After knowing the students' ability in writing recount text, the next step was done. The intervention or the implementation of text planner combined with self-assessment was applied in the class. By utilizing a text planner and self-assessment rubric to enhance to see the students' writing recount text ability. At this stage, students were provided with a structured text planner that guides them through the key stages of recount writing and self-assessment rubric to evaluate their own writing. The treatments were done in four meetings. After they had been treated with text planner combined with self-assessment, then finally, the participants undergo the posttest which measures their writing skill after the intervention.

After data was gathered, the next step is to analyze the data. In analysing the data, statistical techniques using SPSS were applied. Descriptive Statistics, such as minimum score, maximum score, and means score are calculated to summarize the students' writing scores. In addition, inferential statistics were also used in this research. It was to establish the significance of any improvements in the students' writing skill after the implementation of the textplanner and self-assessment rubric using Paired Sample T-tests. In order to use t-test, the data distribution must be normal, then the analysis of data distribution normality is assessed using the Normality Test

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Before calculating the pre-test and post test results, Normality test was used to see whether the data distribution is normal or not. Shapiro-Wilk Test was used to see the distribution of the data because the respondents or the number of students as the subject study is less than 50 respondents ($N < 50$). Data distribution is categorized as normal if the sig. value is more than 0.05 (> 0.05) but the data is categorized as not normal if the Sig. value is less than 0.05 (< 0.05) (Mat Roni & Djajadikerta, 2021). The result of the normality test can be seen in Table 2.

Table 2: Tests of Normality Result

	Kolmogorov-Smirnov ^a			Shapiro-Wilk		
	Statistic	df	Sig.	Statistic	df	Sig.
pretest writing	,073	32	,200*	,975	32	,640
Posttest writing	,138	32	,125	,961	32	,287

*. This is a lower bound of the true significance.

a. Lilliefors Significance Correction

From Table 2, it can be seen that the result of the normality test using Shapiro-Wilk Test indicates normal data distribution. The Sig. value is 0.640 for pre-test and 0.287 for the post test, it indicates that the data distributions for both the pre-test and post-test follow a normal distribution. This is supported by the fact that the Significance values for both tests are above 0.05. Since the data distribution is normal, the collected data is able to be calculated using T-test.

To summarize the students' writing scores such as minimum score, maximum score and means are calculated using descriptive statistics. The result of descriptive statistics is shown in Table 3.

Table 3: Descriptive Statistics

	N	Minimum	Maximum	Mean	Std. Deviation
pretest writing	32	45	85	67,27	10,344
Posttest writing	32	70	90	80,08	4,898
Valid N (listwise)	32				

Table 3 shows both the pretest and posttest are administered to 32 students. For the pretest, students' minimum score is 45 and students' maximum score is 85. From that score, it can be calculated that the mean score is 67.27. While for the posttest, students' minimum score is 70 and students' maximum score is 90. The mean score from those scores is 80.08. The score of pretests is considered as the initial score and the score of posttests as the final score. The researcher employs the Paired Sample T-test to examine the data sampling. This test compares the means of paired sample T-test is to see the difference of the samples. The result of the Paired Sample t-test is served in Table 4.

Table 4: Paired Samples t-test

	Paired Differences						t	df	Sig. (2-tailed)
	Mean	Std. Deviation	Std. Error Mean	95% Confidence Interval of the Difference					
				Lower	Upper				
Pair 1 pretest writing - Posttest writing	-12,813	6,016	1,063	-14,981	-10,644	-12,048	31	,000	

The result of the Paired Sample *t*-test in Table 4 shows that the sig. value is 0.000. It means that the value is less than 0.05. It means that the implementation of text planner combined with self-assessment rubric give significant impact on students' recount text writing ability. In other words, the utilization of text planner combined with self-assessment has been found to positively contribute to the improvement of students' writing recount text ability.

The findings reveal that the use of text planner combined with self-assessment can significantly affect students' ability to write recount texts. The result of the Shapiro-Wilk normality test shows that the pretest and posttest data are normally distributed. So, parametric statistical analysis, such as the Paired Sample *t*-test, is very likely to be used to test the difference between students' initial and final scores in writing recount text. The results of descriptive statistical analysis show a significant increase in students' recount writing performance from pretest to posttest. The average score increased from 67.27 to 80.08. Such results indicate that the intervention of using a text planner combined with self-assessment had a positive impact on students' ability in writing recount texts. Furthermore, the result of the Paired Samples *t*-test confirms the statistical significance of the observed improvement. The sig. (2-tailed) of 0.000 which is less than the standard significance level of 0.05, indicates that the difference in pretest and posttest scores is very unlikely to occur by chance. These findings provide strong evidence that the combination of text planner and self-assessment is effective in improving students' ability to write recount text.

These results align with the existing literature on the benefits of using text planners and self-assessment to support students' writing development. The text planner helps the students organize their recount texts more effectively. This finding is in line with Harris and Graham (1996) that stated a text planner is a graphic organizer that helps students systematically plan the key elements of a text like orientation and series of event before writing. From this finding, it can be seen that students finally can organize the event of their story that they have to draw in a writing form of recount text that usually the students having difficulties on it (Wijayatiningsih & Kurniawan, 2018). Besides, through text planner, students know what their goal in writing is so that the students can write well, this indicates that after knowing what their goal is, they are able to write. This finding confirms Boumediene and Fatiha (2021) that stated students can achieve their goal if they understand that goal themselves.

Moreover, self-assessment enables them to evaluate their own writing. Self-assessment has a very good effect on students' writing ability. The result of the study showed that the use of self-assessment strategy is effective for students in writing recount text. This finding strengthens Tampubolon et al.,'s (2023) research findings that stated students' self-assessment is effective to improve students' writing ability. Furthermore, self-assessment helps students in evaluating their work (Yoshida, 2018) and improves their awareness of their responsibility that they are learners (Adiguna et al., 2023). Through self-assessment, students also can improve their weakness and strength of their own writing (Oscarcon, 2009; Eman, 2022).

In addition, the text planner combined with self-assessment is effective for the students to enhance their recount text ability. This finding reveals that the treatment implemented in the class raises students' motivation and engagement in the writing class so that they can finish their job on the right time. This finding shows that through the understanding of their job, they engage in the class and they can achieve the learning goal (Aslan & Şahin, 2020; Mafulah & Cahyono, 2023) and they also do self-reflection

(Wang, 2019). It means that through text planner combined with self-assessment, students more engage in the writing class, can improve their writing ability, and improve their self-awareness of what they have written.

CONCLUSION

In a nutshell, the present study reveals that the use of text planner combined with self-assessment has potential to improve the students' ability in writing recount text. The use of a text planner really helps students convey ideas more coherently so that their writing becomes more organized, while self-assessment facilitates students to do self-reflection which makes them aware of their shortcomings or mistakes in writing recount text. However, future research is needed to explore the long-term impact of the combined approach on students' writing development and its transferability to other genres of writing. Moreover, larger-scale studies with control groups and diverse student populations would further strengthen the validity and generalizability of the findings.

REFERENCES

- Adiguna, I. W. B., Dewi, N. L. P. E. S., Paramartha, A. a. G. Y., & Wahyuni, L. G. E. (2023). Teacher's Perception of Self-Assessment in English Writing Competency for Junior High School students. *Jurnal Pendidikan Bahasa Inggris Undiksha*, 11(1), 104–112. <https://doi.org/10.23887/jpbi.v11i1.64935>
- Amalia, Hilma & Abdullah, Fuad & Fatimah, Asri. (2021). Teaching writing to junior high school students: A focus on challenges and solutions. *Journal of Language and Linguistic Studies*. 17. 794-810. 10.17263/jlls.904066.
- Amellia, R., Ambarini, R., & Lestari, S. (2023). The Effectiveness of Self-Assessment through Recount Texts on Improving Writing Skill. In *Proceeding of English Teaching, Literature and Linguistics (Eternal) Conference*.
- Aslan, R., & Şahin, M. (2020). 'I feel like i go blank': Identifying the factors affecting classroom participation in an oral communication course. *Teflin Journal*, 31(1), 19–43. <https://doi.org/10.15639/teflinjournal.v31i1/19-43>
- Aubrey, S., King, J., & Almukhaild, H. (2020). Language Learner Engagement During Speaking Tasks: A Longitudinal Study. *RELC Journal*. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0033688220945418>
- Boumediene, D., & Kaid Fatiha, P. (2021). Self-assessment of writing skills: An effective method in English classes. *International Journal for Cultural Studies*, 1–11. Retrieved from <https://www.inst.at/trans/25/>
- Erman Aslanoğlu, A. (2022). Examining the Effect of Peer and Self-Assessment Practices on Writing Skills. *International Journal of Assessment Tools in Education*, 9(Special Issue), 179-196. <https://doi.org/10.21449/ijate.1127815>
- Febriansyah, Vikri & Nugraha, Irsyad & Fajriah, Yustika. (2020). An Analysis of Students' Difficulties in Writing Recount Texts. *English Education and Applied Linguistics Journal (EEALJournal)*.3. 98-106. 10.31980/eealjournal.v3i2.1837.
- Harris, K. R., & Graham, S. (1996). *Making the Writing Process Work: Strategies for Composition and Self-Regulation*. Brookline Books.

- Lestari, I Dewa Ayu Made. (2023). Assessing Writing Ability of the Tenth-Grade Students of SMAN2 BL through Guided Questions and Answers. *Journal of Language, Literature, Social, and Cultural Studies*, 1 16-23
- Liu, H., & Brantmeier, C. (2019). "I know English": Self-assessment of foreign language reading and writing abilities among young Chinese learners of English. *System*, 80, 60–72. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.system.2018.10.013>
- Mafulah, S., & Cahyono, B. Y. (2023). Indonesian students' engagement in online EFL writing class and their perceptions on teacher feedback. *Indonesian Journal of Applied Linguistics*, 13(1), 152–164. <https://doi.org/10.17509/ijal.v13i1.58279>
- Mak, P., & Wong, K. M. (2018). Self-regulation through portfolio assessment in writing classrooms. *ELT Journal*, 72(1), 49–61. <https://doi.org/10.1093/elt/ccx012>
- Mat Roni, S., & Djajadikerta, H. G. (2021). Data Analysis with SPSS for Survey-based Research. In *Data Analysis with SPSS for Survey-based Research*. <https://doi.org/10.1007/978-981-16-0193-4>
- Nunan, David. (2003). *Practical English Language Teaching*. McGraw-Hill/Contemporary. New York.
- Purba, C. N., & Hutauruk, B. S. (2022). Error Analysis of the Students in Using Simple Present Tense Writing Descriptive Text. *Indonesian Journal of Education, Social Sciences and Research (IJESSR)*, 3(2), 44–51. <http://jurnal.umsu.ac.id/index.php/ijessr>
- Situmorang, Maria Magdalena., Hutauruk, Bertaria Sohnata, & Purba, Christian Neni. (2023). The Effect of Diary Writing on the Students' Ability in Writing Recount Text at Grade X of SMA Negeri 4 Pematang Siantar. *Journal on Education*, 6 (1).
- Solhi, M., & Eginli, I. (2020). The Effect of Recorded Oral Feedback on EFL Learners' Writing. *Journal of Language and Linguistic Studies*, 16(1), 01-13.
- Sugiyono, 2015. *Metode Penelitian Kombinasi (Mix Methods)*. Bandung: Alfabeta.
- Tampubolon, Sahlan, & Sipayung, Kammer, & Sagala, Melvi. (2023). The Effect of Self-Assessment Strategy on Students' Writing Recount Text at Eight Grade of SMP Swasta Advent 5 Medan. *Journal of Language Education (JoLE)*, 1(1), 81-88
- Wahab, I., & Astri, Z. (2022). Students' Interest in Using Semantic Mapping Technique in Learning English Writing Ability. *Journal of Indonesian Scholars for Social Research*, 2(1), 68–71. Retrieved from <https://www.ojs.ycit.or.id/index.php/JISSR/article/view/19>
- Wang, F. H. (2019). On the relationships between behaviors and achievement in technology-mediated flipped classrooms: A two-phase online behavioral PLS-SEM model. *Computers and Education*, 142(August), 103653. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.compedu.2019.103653>
- Weigle, S. C. (2002). *Assessing Writing* (J. C. Alderson & L. F. Bachman, Eds.; 1st Cambridge.
- Wijayatiningih, T. D., & Kurniawan, E. H. (2018). *Developing Recount Text Writing*

Materials for 8th Grade Students of Junior High School. *Journal of English Language Teaching*, 7(1), 146-155.

Yoshida, M. T. (2018). The Role of Self-Assessment in Developing L2 Writing. *TESOL Journal*, 9(1), 80-99.

Zhang, X. S., & Zhang, L. J. (2022). Sustaining Learners' Writing Development: Effects of Using Self-Assessment on Their Foreign Language Writing Performance and Rating Accuracy. *Sustainability (Switzerland)*, 14(22).
<https://doi.org/10.3390/su142214686>